



Special Meeting of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee
Meeting Minutes for
Friday, September 9, 2022, at 1:00 p.m.
(Virtual Meeting *via* Microsoft Teams Platform)

At 1:02 p.m. Executive Session [Call to Order, Roll Call and Opening Remarks by Commission Chairperson (Sha Brown) and Review Committee Chairperson (Marvin Boyer)]

Chairperson Brown called the Executive Session of the Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission's (Commission) Bias-Based Policing Review Committee (Review Committee) to order [where a quorum was present] and provided an overview of the Review Committee's proposed Special Meeting Agenda.

To refresh Commissioners' recollections, Chairperson Brown recapped the status of the committee's review of **Internal Case No. 21-0010-P** [holdover from the Commission's first Review Cycle] and summarized relevant confidential details of the internal investigation completed by the Pennsylvania State Police (PSP) of the underlying incident which occurred on January 14, 2019 in Troop F and subsequent bias-based policing complaint. At its Special Meeting held on July 26, 2022, the Review Committee authorized the drafting of a **Preliminary Investigative Review Report for Internal Case No. 21-0010-P** which was distributed to members for review prior to the meeting. Chairperson Brown asked if any Commissioner wished to engage in any pre-deliberative discussion concerning any confidential records or other confidential information related to PSP's completed internal administrative investigation that may affect the contents of the draft preliminary report, as written, and Commissioners responded in the negative.

Chairperson Brown also announced that the Commission's last quarterly (regular) meeting for the year is scheduled for October 28, 2022 at 10:00 a.m. in Harrisburg and that he anticipated the presentation of six preliminary reports to the Commission for further consideration [this Review Committee will present its preliminary report for **Internal Case No. 21-0010-P**]. The Commission expected to complete all outstanding reviews and no Review Committee will begin any new case review during the transition period between administrations.

With no further confidential, pre-deliberative, or administrative matters before it, the Review Committee's Executive Session ended at 1:08 p.m.

[Commissioner and Review Committee Member Dr. A. Suresh Canagarajah, Ph.D. joined the meeting at 1:22 p.m.]

Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission

At 1:27 p.m. Public Session of Special Meeting Commenced and Recording Began

At 1:27 p.m. Call to Order, Roll Call, and Opening Remarks by Commission Chairperson (Sha Brown)

Chairperson Brown called the Special Meeting of the Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission's (Commission) Bias-Based Policing Review Committee (Review Committee) to order, announced that the meeting was being recorded and participation in the meeting conferred consent to being recorded. Chairperson Brown asked the Commission's Secretary (Jaimie L. Hicks) to conduct a Roll Call and Commissioners Marvin Boyer [Review Committee Chairperson], Brenda Tate, Denise Ashe, Keir Bradford-Grey, Esq., and Suresh Canagarajah were present remotely and a quorum of the Review Committee was recorded. The Commission's Ex-Officio Member Angela Fitterer (representing the Office of the Governor) and its Vice-Chairperson Elizabeth Pittinger were also present remotely. A copy of the Roll Call and Attendance Form is attached hereto and made a part hereof **[see Attachment 1]**.

At 1:28 p.m. Public Comment Reminder

Chairperson Brown reminded members of the public of the various ways citizens may participate and offer public comment before and during all meetings of the Commission and the Commission's Subcommittees and Review Committees to ensure public participation and transparency. For purposes of this Special Meeting, Chairperson Brown limited public comment to three minutes per speaker.

At 1:29 p.m. Motion to Approve Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's Meeting Agenda by Unanimous Consent

Chairperson Brown asked for a motion to approve the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's Meeting Agenda by unanimous consent. The motion was offered and seconded by Review Committee members in attendance. Chairperson Brown asked if there were any objection(s) to the Meeting Agenda and after hearing no objections, Chairperson Brown recognized the approval of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's Meeting Agenda by unanimous consent. A copy of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's September 9, 2022, Meeting Agenda, as adopted, is attached hereto, and made a part hereof **[see Attachment 2]**.

At 1:29 p.m. Motion to Approve Adoption of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's DRAFT July 26, 2022, Meeting Minutes by Unanimous Consent

Chairman Brown asked for a motion to approve the draft of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's July 26, 2022, Meeting Minutes by unanimous consent. The motion was offered and seconded by Review Committee members. Unanimous consent to approve adoption of the draft of the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's July 26, 2022, Meeting Minutes passed with no noted objections [a copy of the Meeting Minutes as adopted is available on the Review Committee's webpage found at www.osig.pa.gov/PSLECAC].

At 1:30 p.m. Other Review Committee Administrative Matters

Review Committee Chairperson Boyer did not have any administrative matters to report and no other comments to offer.

At 1:30 p.m. Continued Consideration, Discussion, and Deliberation in Anticipation of Issuing a Preliminary Investigative Review Report for Internal Case No. 21-0010-P for Presentation to the Commission

Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission

Chairperson Brown began the discussion by stating the Review Committee engaged in significant and substantial deliberations regarding the completed internal investigation by the Pennsylvania State Police (PSP) concerning an incident [which occurred on January 14, 2019 in Troop F] and subsequent bias-based policing complaint. The Review Committee authorized the drafting of a **Preliminary Investigative Review Report for Internal Case No. 21-0010-P** [during its Special Meeting held on July 26, 2022] for internal distribution and review in preparation of today's meeting. Chairperson Brown then asked if any Commissioner wished to offer any amendments or had any other comments related to the draft preliminary report and relinquished the floor to Review Committee Chairperson Boyer.

Review Committee Chairperson Boyer stated he believed the draft preliminary report was well written and did not have any amendments or other comments to offer. Commissioners Bradford-Grey, Tate, and Ashe also did not have any amendments or any further comments to offer. [Because Commissioner Canagarajah had difficulty with sound, he wrote in the Chat Room that he did not have any changes].

With no amendments or other comments offered, Chairperson Brown asked for a motion to move the Review Committee's draft **Preliminary Investigative Review Report for Internal Case No. 21-0010-P** to PSP for an opportunity to respond and invite PSP to its Special Meeting scheduled for September 21, 2022 at 1:00 p.m. [in accordance with **Section 8.3 (Covered Agency's Opportunity to Respond to Preliminary Report)** of the Commission's Bylaws]. Review Committee Chairperson Boyer offered the motion, which was seconded, and no objections were noted. Chairperson Brown recognized the Review Committee's action.

At this time, Chairperson Brown opened the floor to both specific comments [concerning **Internal Case No. 21-0010-P**] and general comments regarding any business of the Review Committee, and no individual offered any comment.

With no further deliberations or any other business, Chairperson Brown asked Review Committee Chairperson Boyer if he had any final remarks or comments and Review Committee Chairperson Boyer responded he did not have anything to add. The Review Committee's Public Session ended at 1:34 p.m.

At 1:34 p.m. Announcements by Commission Chairperson

Chairperson Brown provided closing remarks and informed the public about how to file complaints using the Commission's hotline, access the Commission's webpage, and contact the Office of State Inspector General (OSIG) and the OSIG's Bureau of Law Enforcement Oversight for assistance.

At 1:34 p.m. Special Meeting of the Bias-based Policing Review Committee Adjourned

Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission



Roll Call and Attendance Form

Type of Commission Meeting: Quarterly Special Rescheduled
 Date and Time of Committee Meeting: September 9, 2022 AT 1 PM
 Name of Committee: BIAS-BASED POLICING REVIEW COMMITTEE

Pursuant to Article 6, Sections 2 and 5 of the Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission's (Commission) Bylaws, I hereby attest to having a Roll Call of Committee Membership performed at the above listed Committee meeting and recording attendance of Committee members as indicated below:

Seat Name	Name of Commission Member	Attendance		
		Present	Excused Absence	Absent
At-Large Seat 1	David A. Sonenshein			
At-Large Seat 2	Dr. A. Suresh Canagarajah, Ph.D.	✓		
At-Large Seat 3	Kelley B. Hodge, Esquire			
At-Large Seat 4	Denise Ashe	✓		
At-Large Seat 5	Elizabeth C. Pittinger	✓		
At-Large Seat 6	Keir Bradford-Grey	✓		
Troop A Seat	Jeffrey Wilson			
Troop B Seat	Brenda Tate	✓		
Troop C Seat	Joshua S. Maines, Esquire			
Troop D Seat	Marisa C. Williams			
Troop E Seat	Bishop Curtis L. Jones, Sr.			
Troop F Seat	Honorable Erick J. Coolidge			
Troop G Seat	Charima C. Young			
Troop H Seat	Spero T. Lappas, J.D., Ph.D			
Troop J Seat	VACANT			
Troop K Seat	Andrea A. Lawful-Sanders			
Troop L Seat	VACANT			
Troop M Seat	Marvin Boyer	✓		
Troop N Seat	Marilyn M. Brown, Ed.D.			
Troop P Seat	Rev. Shawn M. Walker			
Troop R Seat	Krista Somers			

**Signature of Sha S. Brown,
Commission Chairperson**



**BIAS-BASED POLICING REVIEW COMMITTEE
SPECIAL MEETING AGENDA**

The Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission (Commission), established by Executive Order 2020-04 (as amended by Governor Tom Wolf on April 30, 2021) announces a Special Meeting of the Commission's Bias-Based Policing Review Committee (Review Committee) to be held in person at the **Office of State Inspector General located at 555 Walnut Street, 7th Floor, Forum Place, Harrisburg, PA 17101** and virtually *via* the Commission's information technology platform (Microsoft Teams) on **Friday, September 9, 2022, at 1:00pm (Executive Session) and at 1:30pm (Public Session).**

In accordance with 65 Pa.C.S. § 709(b) and Article 6, Section 2 of the Commission's Bylaws, the Review Committee's Meeting Agenda consists of the following items:

- (1) Executive Session [*closed to the public* – Review of Meeting Agenda; Recap of previous confidential and pre-deliberative discussions related to, and proposed schedule for completion of, **Internal Case Nos. 21-0010-P** for purposes of issuing a Preliminary Investigative Review Report; and other administrative matters];
- (2) Call to Order and Roll Call [*expected to begin at approximately 1:30pm*];
- (3) Acceptance of Meeting Agenda;
- (4) Approval and adoption of previous Special Meeting Minutes from July 26, 2022;
- (5) Approval of administrative and/or other procedural matters;
- (6) Report by the Bias-Based Policing Review Committee's Chairperson;
- (7) Opportunity for general public comment;
- (8) Continued discussion, deliberation and official action(s) concerning finalization of proposed Findings and Conclusions which include: (i) whether the Covered Agency's completed internal investigation was prompt, fair, impartial, complete, and reasonable; (ii) whether the substance of all related bias-based policing and any other relevant internal policies, procedures, controls, regulations, guidance, practices and/or training of the Covered Agency were adequate and effective; and (iii) if not considered adequate and/or effective, identification of best practices and what recommendation(s), if any, may be necessary to minimize and/or reduce the likelihood of future incidents and complaints in anticipation of issuing a **Preliminary Investigative Review Report for Internal Case No. 21-0010-P** and authority to distribute draft to the Covered Agency for an opportunity to respond in accordance with Section 8.2 of the Commission's Bylaws;
- (9) Opportunity for special public comment concerning **Internal Case No. 21-0010-P**; and
- (10) Opportunity for general public comment.

Individuals having questions regarding this Special Meeting of the Commission's Bias-Based Policing Review Committee, which is open to the public, should contact the Bureau of Law Enforcement Oversight within the Pennsylvania Office State Inspector General (OSIG) at (717) 787-6835. Media inquiries may be directed to the OSIG's Deputy State Inspector General for External Affairs Jonathan Hendrickson at (717) 265-8396.

Sha S. Brown, Chairperson
*Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory
Commission*

Pennsylvania State Law Enforcement Citizen Advisory Commission

Commission's Webpage:
www.osig.pa.gov/psleacac

Tel: 717-772-4935
555 Walnut Street, 8th Floor, Forum Place | Harrisburg, PA 17101

